

All Hope is Not Lost: Raising a New Argument on Appeal

October 25, 2018



Your client has brought you an appeal, and you quickly spot what looks like a winning argument. Unfortunately, it was never raised or argued below. Being a savvy appellate lawyer, you understand you cannot raise it for the first time on appeal. Time to move on, right? Not always. In *Lopez Ventura v. Sessions*, --- F.3d ----, 2018 WL 5093238 (5th Cir. Oct. 19, 2018), the Fifth Circuit Court of Appeals granted relief to Manuel Lopez Ventura, based on a specific argument that was raised for the first time on appeal. The short backstory is

this. Lopez Ventura pleaded guilty in Louisiana to possessing AB-CHMINACA, a synthetic cannabinoid. After his conviction, he left the country, but later returned and applied to be admitted as a lawful permanent resident. By administrative order, the Board of Immigration Appeals (BIA) found him to be inadmissible, reasoning that AB-CHMINACA was a controlled substance on the date of his *conviction* in Louisiana. As it turns out, AB-CHMINACA was added to the federal schedules of controlled substances after Lopez Ventura was arrested but before he was convicted. Although he argued to the Immigration Judge that AB-CHMINACA was not a controlled substance on the date of his offense, he did not specifically argue that there is a presumption against retroactive application of a federal statute. The Fifth Circuit granted his petition for review and determined, *inter alia*, that the argument could be pursued on appeal because “[t]he presumption against retroactivity is merely a tool of statutory interpretation, not a separate claim for relief.” The court then reversed the BIA’s order and remanded. **Preservation Issues**

- “It is settled practice that to be considered on review, an issue must generally have been ‘pressed or passed upon’ in the tribunal a quo.”
- But, “[t]he presumption against retroactivity is merely a tool of statutory interpretation, not a separate claim for relief.”

Tip(s) Although it is always best to preserve claims, issues, and supporting arguments with as much specificity as possible in the first instance, there are *limited* occasions where the introduction of new

arguments on appeal in support of preserved claims or issues may be permitted. This case is an example of one such instance, but there are others as well. *See, e.g., Yee v. Escondido*, 503 U.S. 519, 534 (1992) (in narrow circumstances, “[o]nce a . . . claim is properly presented, a party can make any argument in support of that claim” on appeal). Consequently, before losing all hope of introducing a new argument on appeal, consider whether the new argument is truly unpreserved or whether it might be framed in a way so as to be cognizable.

Authored By



Joseph H. Lang Jr.

Related Practices

[Appellate & Trial Support
Litigation and Trials](#)

©2024 Carlton Fields, P.A. Carlton Fields practices law in California through Carlton Fields, LLP. Carlton Fields publications should not be construed as legal advice on any specific facts or circumstances. The contents are intended for general information and educational purposes only, and should not be relied on as if it were advice about a particular fact situation. The distribution of this publication is not intended to create, and receipt of it does not constitute, an attorney-client relationship with Carlton Fields. This publication may not be quoted or referred to in any other publication or proceeding without the prior written consent of the firm, to be given or withheld at our discretion. To request reprint permission for any of our publications, please use our Contact Us form via the link below. The views set forth herein are the personal views of the author and do not necessarily reflect those of the firm. This site may contain hypertext links to information created and maintained by other entities. Carlton Fields does not control or guarantee the accuracy or completeness of this outside information, nor is the inclusion of a link to be intended as an endorsement of those outside sites.